

Appendix 2 - Waste Management Options Appraisal Shortlisting Scoring

| | | Option 1 (baseline) | Option 2 | Option 3 | Option 4 | Option 5 | Option 6 | Option 7 | Option 8 | Option 9 | Option 10 | Option 11 | |
|--|------------------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Future Sustainable Resource Management Options Appraisal | | 240ltr bin Fortnightly | 240ltr bin Fortnightly | 240ltr bin Fortnightly | 240ltr bin Fortnightly | 240ltr bin Fortnightly | 240ltr bin Fortnightly | 240ltr bin 3-weekly | 240ltr bin 4-weekly | 240ltr bin 3-weekly | 140ltr bin Fortnightly | 140ltr bin Fortnightly | |
| | | 240ltr bin Fortnightly | 240ltr bin Fortnightly | 240ltr bin Fortnightly | 240ltr bin Fortnightly | 240ltr bin Fortnightly | 240ltr bin Fortnightly | 240ltr bin Fortnightly | 240ltr bin Fortnightly | 240ltr bin Weekly | 240ltr bin Fortnightly | 240ltr bin Fortnightly | Bags / Boxes Weekly |
| | | 240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription) | 240ltr bin Fortnightly (free) <small>**residents one off payment for a brown bin</small> | 240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription) | 240ltr F&G bin* Fortnightly (free) | 23ltr bin** Weekly | 70ltr bin* Fortnightly | 23ltr bin** Weekly | 23ltr bin** Weekly | 70ltr bin* Fortnightly | 23ltr bin** Weekly | 23ltr bin** Weekly | 23ltr bin** Weekly |
| | | | | Bags / Boxes Increase range of materials incl separate WEEE, textiles & additional plastics | | 240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription) | 240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription) | 240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription) | 240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription) | 240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription) | 240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription) | 240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription) | 240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription) |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Critical Success Factors | Weighting | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1. To achieve the objectives of the Wirral Plan: - Will achieve the target of 50% recycling by 2020 - Will lead to optimum levels of resident's participation in recycling. - Will deliver the objectives of Wirral's Waste Management Strategy. - Will lead to a reduction in waste generated in Wirral | H | 3 | 6 | 3 | 3 | 9 | 6 | 12 | 12 | 12 | 12 | 9 | |
| 2. To support long term sustainable resource management objectives: - To meet the requirements of the waste hierarchy and waste minimisation - Will drive environmental sustainability, carbon reduction and climate change objectives. - Can be developed to address potential legislative changes | H | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 3 | 12 | 12 | 12 | 12 | 9 | |
| 3. Deliverability of option: - Can be mobilised to be in place by April 2017 - The cost of the option in terms of capital outlay and ongoing operations - Offers value for money - Will provide a reliable operation - Can facilitate complimentary provision from the third and community sectors. | H | 9 | 6 | 6 | 0* | 9 | 9 | 12 | 12 | 12 | 6 | 3 | |
| 4. Resident ownership and participation - Simplicity of system to use - Implications for households - Ability to respond to resident insight - Applicability to Wirral's contrasting socio demographics - Equality impact assessment | H | 9 | 9 | 9 | 6 | 6 | 3 | 9 | 6 | 6 | 9 | 3 | |
| 5. Local environmental impact - Environment impact assessment | L | 3 | 3 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | |
| 6. Compliant with legislation (including TEEP) | M | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 6 | |
| 7. Flexibility and adaptability: - To become part of a future City Region arrangement. - Can be further developed to address new waste streams | M | 6 | 6 | 6 | 2 | 6 | 4 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 2 | |
| Total (Score x Weighting) | | 34 | 34 | 30 | 18 | 45 | 33 | 59 | 55 | 55 | 53 | 33 | |

| Weighting |
|------------|
| High = 3 |
| Medium = 2 |
| Low = 1 |

| Score | Criteria |
|-------|----------------------------------|
| 0 | Does not meet the objective |
| 1 | Not likely to meet the objective |
| 2 | Partially meets the objective |
| 3 | Meets the objective |
| 4 | Exceeds the objective |

| Key | |
|-----|-------------------------|
| | General household waste |
| | Recycling |
| | Garden waste |
| | Food waste |
| | Bags/boxes |

* Unproven technology not suitable for IVC by 2017

** Food waste will have a kitchen caddy, biodegradable bag & outside bin