

**Appendix 2 - Waste Management Options Appraisal Shortlisting Scoring**

		Option 1 (baseline)	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4	Option 5	Option 6	Option 7	Option 8	Option 9	Option 10	Option 11	
<b>Future Sustainable Resource Management Options Appraisal</b>		240ltr bin Fortnightly	240ltr bin Fortnightly	240ltr bin Fortnightly	240ltr bin Fortnightly	240ltr bin Fortnightly	240ltr bin Fortnightly	240ltr bin 3-weekly	240ltr bin 4-weekly	240ltr bin 3-weekly	140ltr bin Fortnightly	140ltr bin Fortnightly	
		240ltr bin Fortnightly	240ltr bin Fortnightly	240ltr bin Fortnightly	240ltr bin Fortnightly	240ltr bin Fortnightly	240ltr bin Fortnightly	240ltr bin Fortnightly	240ltr bin Weekly	240ltr bin Fortnightly	240ltr bin Fortnightly	Bags / Boxes Weekly	
		240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription)	240ltr bin Fortnightly (free) <small>**residents one off payment for a brown bin</small>	240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription)	240ltr F&G bin* Fortnightly (free)	23ltr bin** Weekly	70ltr bin* Fortnightly	23ltr bin** Weekly	23ltr bin** Weekly	70ltr bin* Fortnightly	23ltr bin** Weekly	23ltr bin** Weekly	
				Bags / Boxes Increase range of materials incl separate WEEE, textiles & additional plastics		240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription)	240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription)	240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription)	240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription)	240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription)	240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription)	240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription)	240ltr bin Fortnightly (subscription)
<b>Critical Success Factors</b>	<b>Weighting</b>												
1. To achieve the objectives of the Wirral Plan: - Will achieve the target of 50% recycling by 2020 - Will lead to optimum levels of resident's participation in recycling. - Will deliver the objectives of Wirral's Waste Management Strategy. - Will lead to a reduction in waste generated in Wirral	H	3	6	3	3	9	6	12	12	12	12	9	
2. To support long term sustainable resource management objectives: - To meet the requirements of the waste hierarchy and waste minimisation - Will drive environmental sustainability, carbon reduction and climate change objectives. - Can be developed to address potential legislative changes	H	0	0	0	0	6	3	12	12	12	12	9	
3. Deliverability of option: - Can be mobilised to be in place by April 2017 - The cost of the option in terms of capital outlay and ongoing operations - Offers value for money - Will provide a reliable operation - Can facilitate complimentary provision from the third and community sectors.	H	9	6	6	0*	9	9	12	12	12	6	3	
4. Resident ownership and participation - Simplicity of system to use - Implications for households - Ability to respond to resident insight - Applicability to Wirral's contrasting socio demographics - Equality impact assessment	H	9	9	9	6	6	3	9	6	6	9	3	
5. Local environmental impact - Environment impact assessment	L	3	3	2	3	3	2	2	1	1	2	1	
6. Compliant with legislation (including TEEP)	M	4	4	4	4	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	
7. Flexibility and adaptability: - To become part of a future City Region arrangement. - Can be further developed to address new waste streams	M	6	6	6	2	6	4	6	6	6	6	2	
<b>Total (Score x Weighting)</b>		<b>34</b>	<b>34</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>45</b>	<b>33</b>	<b>59</b>	<b>55</b>	<b>55</b>	<b>53</b>	<b>33</b>	

<b>Weighting</b>
High = 3
Medium = 2
Low = 1

<b>Score</b>	<b>Criteria</b>
0	Does not meet the objective
1	Not likely to meet the objective
2	Partially meets the objective
3	Meets the objective
4	Exceeds the objective

<b>Key</b>	
	General household waste
	Recycling
	Garden waste
	Food waste
	Bags/boxes

\* Unproven technology not suitable for IVC by 2017

\*\* Food waste will have a kitchen caddy, biodegradable bag & outside bin