

APPENDIX 1 – EVALUATION DETAILS AND RESULTS

Contract Title: Highways Services - A1.1 SURFACE DRESSING PROCESSES							
Contract Quality Ratio:		40	Quality Threshold:				
Social Value Ratio:		10					
Contract Price Ratio:		50	Highest Quality Score: 4.00		Lowest Tender Price (£): 391,929.89		
			KIELY BROS LTD		BIDDER 2		
Criteria	Weight %	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score		
Quality Scores							
MS 1 – Operational, quality, methodology	20.00	4	0.80	2	0.40		
MS 2 – Health Safety and Environment	20.00	4	0.80	2	0.40		
MS 3 – Service Management	25.00	4	1.00	2	0.50		
MS 4 – Supply Chain Management	15.00	4	0.60	2.5	0.38		
MS 5 – Public engagement	20.00	4	0.80	2	0.40		
Totals	100.00		4.00		2.08		
Is overall quality threshold reached?			yes		yes		
Quality points (as a % of highest score)			100.00		51.88		
Social Value Scores							
Social value (Score from SVP normalised as score out of 100)	10	80	8.00	10.15	1.02		
Price Scores							
Total Tender Price (£)		£391,929.89		£0			
Price points (lowest/actual*100)		100.00					
Summary Scores							
Quality weighting x quality score		100.00	0.40	40.00	51.88	0.40	20.75
Social value weighting x social value score		80.00	0.10	8.00	10.15	0.10	1.02
Price weighting x price score		100.00	0.50	50.00	0.00	0.50	0.00
Overall Score				98.00			21.77
Order of Tenders (Descending)		1					

*BIDDER 2 NOT EVALUATED

APPENDIX 1 – EVALUATION DETAILS AND RESULTS

Contract Title: Highways Services - A1.2 MICRO ASPHALT PROCESSES									
Contract Quality Ratio:		40	Quality Threshold:						
Social Value Ratio:		10							
Contract Price Ratio:		50	Highest Quality Score: 4.00		Lowest Tender Price (£): 374,488.34				
Criteria	Weight %	BIDDER 2		KIELY BROS LTD		BIDDER 3			
		Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score		
Quality Scores									
MS 1 – Operational, quality, methodology	20.00	4	0.80	4	0.80	2	0.40		
MS 2 – Health Safety and Environment	20.00	3.5	0.70	4	0.80	2	0.40		
MS 3 – Service Management	25.00	4	1.00	4	1.00	2	0.50		
MS 4 – Supply Chain Management	15.00	4	0.60	4	0.60	2.5	0.38		
MS 5 – Public engagement	20.00	4	0.80	4	0.80	2	0.40		
Totals	100.00		3.90		4.00		2.08		
Is overall quality threshold reached?				yes		yes		yes	
Quality points (as a % of highest score)				97.50		100.00		51.88	
Social Value Scores									
Social value (Score from SVP normalised as score out of 100)	10	95	9.50	32.58	3.26	10.01	1.00		
Price Scores									
Total Tender Price (£)		£422,902.27		£374,488.34		£0			
Price points (lowest/actual*100)		88.55		100.00		0.00			
Quality weighting x quality score		97.50	0.40	39.00	100.00	0.40	40.00	51.88	0.40
Social value weighting x social value score		95.00	0.10	9.50	32.58	0.10	3.26	10.01	0.10
Price weighting x price score		88.55	0.50	44.28	100.00	0.50	50.00	0.00	0.50
Overall Score				92.78			93.26		21.75
Order of Tenders (Descending)		2		1					

*BIDDER 3 NOT EVALUATED

APPENDIX 1 – EVALUATION DETAILS AND RESULTS

Contract Title: Highways Services - A1.3 SLURRY SEALING PROCESSES													
Contract Quality Ratio:		40		Quality Threshold:									
Social Value Ratio:		10											
Contract Price Ratio:		50		Highest Quality Score: 4.43			Lowest Tender Price (£): 270,139.63						
Criteria	Weight %	BIDDER 2		JPCS LTD		BIDDER 3		BIDDER 4					
		Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score		
Quality Scores													
MS 1 – Operational, quality, methodology	20.00	4	0.80	4.5	0.90	4	0.80	2	0.40				
MS 2 – Health Safety and Environment	20.00	3.5	0.70	4.5	0.90	4	0.80	2	0.40				
MS 3 – Service Management	25.00	4	1.00	4.5	1.13	4	1.00	2	0.50				
MS 4 – Supply Chain Management	15.00	4	0.60	4	0.60	4	0.60	2.5	0.38				
MS 5 – Public engagement	20.00	4	0.80	4.5	0.90		0.00	2	0.40				
Totals	100.00		3.90		4.43		3.20		2.08				
Is overall quality threshold reached?			yes		yes		yes		yes				
Quality points (as a % of highest score)			88.14		100.00		72.32		46.89				
Social Value Scores													
Social value (Score from SVP normalised as score out of 100)	10	95	9.50	44.53	4.45	40.92	4.09	10.03	1.00				
Price Scores													
Total Tender Price (£)		£303,595.14		£270,139.63		£292,183.26		£0					
Price points (lowest/actual*100)		88.98		100.00		92.46							
Weighted Scores													
Quality weighting x quality score		88.14	0.40	35.25	100.00	0.40	40.00	72.32	0.40	28.93	46.89	0.40	18.76
Social value weighting x social value score		95.00	0.10	9.50	44.53	0.10	4.45	40.92	0.10	4.09	10.03	0.10	1.00
Price weighting x price score		88.98	0.50	44.49	100.00	0.50	50.00	92.46	0.50	46.23	0.00	0.50	0.00
Overall Score			89.24			94.45			79.25				19.76
Order of Tenders (Descending)		2			1		3						

*BIDDER 4 NOT EVALUATED

APPENDIX 1 – EVALUATION DETAILS AND RESULTS

Contract Title: Highways Services - A1.4 CARRIAGEWAY MICRO ASPHALT HAND APPLIED PATCHING														
Contract Quality Ratio: 40			Quality Threshold:											
Social Value Ratio: 10														
Contract Price Ratio: 50			Highest Quality Score: 4.43		Lowest Tender Price (£): 346,079.38									
			COLAS LTD		BIDDER 2		BIDDER 3		BIDDER 4					
Criteria		Weight %	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score		
Quality Scores														
MS 1 – Operational, quality, methodology		20.00	4	0.80	4.5	0.90	4	0.80	2	0.40				
MS 2 – Health Safety and Environment		20.00	3.5	0.70	4.5	0.90	4	0.80	2	0.40				
MS 3 – Service Management		25.00	4	1.00	4.5	1.13	4	1.00	2	0.50				
MS 4 – Supply Chain Management		15.00	4	0.60	4	0.60	4	0.60	2.5	0.38				
MS 5 – Public engagement		20.00	4	0.80	4.5	0.90	4	0.80	2	0.40				
Totals		100.00		3.90		4.43		4.00		2.08				
Is overall quality threshold reached?				yes		yes		yes		yes				
Quality points (as a % of highest score)				88.14		100.00		90.40		46.89				
Social Value Scores														
Social value (Score from SVP normalised as score out of 100)		10	95	9.50	54.35	5.44	48.32	4.83	10.06	1.01				
Price Scores														
Total Tender Price (£)			£346,079.38		£0		£348,101.13		£0					
Price points (lowest/actual*100)			100.00				99.42							
Weighted Scores														
Quality weighting x quality score			88.14	0.40	35.25	100.00	0.40	40.00	90.40	0.40	36.16	46.89	0.40	18.76
Social value weighting x social value score			95.00	0.10	9.50	54.35	0.10	5.44	48.32	0.10	4.83	10.06	0.10	1.01
Price weighting x price score			100.00	0.50	50.00	0.00	0.50	0.00	99.42	0.50	49.71	0.00	0.50	0.00
Overall Score					94.75			45.44			90.70			19.76
Order of Tenders (Descending)			1				2							

*BIDDER 2 AND BIDDER 4 NOT EVALUATED

APPENDIX 1 – EVALUATION DETAILS AND RESULTS

Contract Title: Highways Services - A1.5 CARRIAGEWAY AND FOOTWAY RETREAD PROCESS						
Contract Quality Ratio:	40	Quality Threshold:				
Social Value Ratio:	10					
Contract Price Ratio:	50	Highest Quality Score:	4.00	Lowest Tender Price (£):	286,183.06	
		Colas Ltd		BIDDER 2		
Criteria	Weight %	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score	
Quality Scores						
MS 1 – Operational, quality, methodology	20.00	4	0.80	4	0.80	
MS 2 – Health Safety and Environment	20.00	3.5	0.70	4	0.80	
MS 3 – Service Management	25.00	4	1.00	4	1.00	
MS 4 – Supply Chain Management	15.00	4	0.60	4	0.60	
MS 5 – Public engagement	20.00	4	0.80	4	0.80	
Totals	100.00		3.90		4.00	
Is overall quality threshold reached?			yes		yes	
Quality points (as a % of highest score)			97.50		100.00	
Social Value Scores						
Social value (Score from SVP normalised as score out of 100)	10	95	9.50	37.79	3.78	
Price Scores						
Total Tender Price (£)		£286,183.06		£478,188.20		
Price points (lowest/actual*100)		100.00		59.85		
Quality weighting x quality score	97.50	0.40	39.00	100.00	0.40	40.00
Social value weighting x social value score	95.00	0.10	9.50	37.79	0.10	3.78
Price weighting x price score	100.00	0.50	50.00	59.85	0.50	29.92
Overall Score			98.50			73.70
Order of Tenders (Descending)		1		2		

APPENDIX 1 – EVALUATION DETAILS AND RESULTS

Contract Title: Highways Services - A2 CARRIAGEWAY STRUCTURAL RESURFACING																			
Contract Quality Ratio:		40		Quality Threshold:															
Social Value Ratio:		10																	
Contract Price Ratio:		50		Highest Quality Score: 4.23 Lowest Tender Price (£): 3,577,765.93															
Criteria	Weight %	BIDDER 2		BIDDER 3		BIDDER 4		HANSON QUARRY		BIDDER 5		BIDDER 6							
		Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score						
Quality Scores																			
MS 1 – Operational, quality, methodology	20.00	4	0.80	4	0.80	3.5	0.70	4	0.80	3	0.60	4	0.80						
MS 2 – Health Safety and Environment	20.00	3	0.60	3.5	0.70	3	0.60	4.5	0.90	3	0.60	3.5	0.70						
MS 3 – Service Management	25.00	4	1.00	4	1.00	3.5	0.88	4.5	1.13	2	0.50	4.5	1.13						
MS 4 – Supply Chain Management	15.00	4.5	0.68	4	0.60	3	0.45	4	0.60	2	0.30	4	0.60						
MS 5 – Public engagement	20.00	4	0.80	4	0.80	3.5	0.70	4	0.80	2	0.40	4.5	0.90						
Totals	100.00		3.88		3.90		3.33		4.23		2.40		4.13						
Is overall quality threshold reached?			yes		yes		yes		yes		yes		yes						
Quality points (as a % of highest score)			91.72		92.31		78.70		100.00		56.80		97.63						
Social Value Scores																			
Social value	10	43.98	4.40	95	9.50	55.5	5.55	45.27	4.53	36.85	3.69	42.42	4.24						
Price Scores																			
Total Tender Price (£)		£4,247,102.98		£4,071,081.77		£3,949,274.10		£3,577,765.93		£8,696,719.76		£0							
Price points (lowest/actual*100)		84.24		87.88		90.59		100.00		41.14									
Quality weighting x quality score		91.72	0.40	36.69	92.31	0.40	36.92	78.70	0.40	31.48	100.00	0.40	40.00	56.80	0.40	22.72	97.63	0.40	39.05
Social value weighting x social value score		43.98	0.10	4.40	95.00	0.10	9.50	55.50	0.10	5.55	45.27	0.10	4.53	36.85	0.10	3.69	42.42	0.10	4.24
Price weighting x price score		84.24	0.50	42.12	87.88	0.50	43.94	90.59	0.50	45.30	100.00	0.50	50.00	41.14	0.50	20.57	0.00	0.50	0.00
Overall Score			83.20		90.36		82.33		94.53		46.98		43.30						
Order of Tenders (Descending)		3		2		4		1		5									

*BIDDER 6 NOT EVALUATED

APPENDIX 1 – EVALUATION DETAILS AND RESULTS

Contract Title: Highways Services - A3 CIVIL AND HIGHWAY ENGINEERING																
Contract Quality Ratio:		40		Quality Threshold:												
Social Value Ratio:		10														
Contract Price Ratio:		50		Highest Quality Score: 4.43		Lowest Tender Price (£): 2,265,961.80										
Criteria	Weight %	BIDDER 2		BIDDER 3		CAMBRIANWAY LTD		BIDDER 4		BIDDER 5						
		Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score	Score	Weighted score					
Quality Scores																
MS 1 – Operational, quality, methodology	20.00	4	0.80	2.5	0.50	4.5	0.90	4	0.80	3.5	0.70					
MS 2 – Health Safety and Environment	20.00	3	0.60	3	0.60	4.5	0.90	3.5	0.70	3	0.60					
MS 3 – Service Management	25.00	3	0.75	3	0.75	4.5	1.13	4	1.00	3.5	0.88					
MS 4 – Supply Chain Management	15.00	3	0.45	3	0.45	4	0.60	4	0.60	3	0.45					
MS 5 – Public engagement	20.00	3	0.60	2	0.40	4.5	0.90	4	0.80	3.5	0.70					
Totals	100.00		3.20		2.70		4.43		3.90		3.33					
Is overall quality threshold reached?			yes		yes		yes		yes		yes					
Quality points (as a % of highest score)			72.32		61.02		100.00		88.14		75.14					
Social Value Scores																
Social value	10	37.36	3.74	75.61	7.56	90	9.00	79.07	7.91	48.57	4.86					
Price Scores																
Total Tender Price (£)		£2,639,007.10		£2,265,961.80		£2,800,904.87		£3,687,975.84		£0						
Price points (lowest/actual*100)		85.86		100.00		80.90		61.44								
Quality weighting x quality score		72.32	0.40	28.93	61.02	0.40	24.41	100.00	0.40	40.00	88.14	0.40	35.25	75.14	0.40	30.06
Social value weighting x social value score		37.36	0.10	3.74	75.61	0.10	7.56	90.00	0.10	9.00	79.07	0.10	7.91	48.57	0.10	4.86
Price weighting x price score		85.86	0.50	42.93	100.00	0.50	50.00	80.90	0.50	40.45	61.44	0.50	30.72	0.00	0.50	0.00
Overall Score			75.59			81.97			89.45			73.88				34.91
Order of Tenders (Descending)		3		2		1		4								

*BIDDER 5 NOT EVALUATED